

SEPTEMBER 2014

Brazilian Regulators Slap \$1.59 Million Fine on Telecom Giant Oi, Alleging Violations of Users' Privacy Rights

by leuan Jolly, Partner and James Taylor, Partner

As a reminder of the transnational nature of online data collection—and the ever-expanding web of regulatory bodies stepping in to monitor how information is collected and used—Brazilian regulators announced that they had issued the nation's first penalty under the country's new Internet law, the Marco Civil da Internet. Brazil's consumer protection agency, the Justice Ministry's Department of Consumer Defense and Protection (DPDC), sued the telecommunications company Oi for a variety of violations relating to Oi's partnership with a U.K.-based online advertising company, Phorm. Together, the companies developed software that tracked and generated profiles of users' browsing practices. The profiles were then sold to online advertising firms, which could ultimately use the data to generate customized "behavioral" advertisements.

The Brazilian law, enacted in April 2014, includes a number of controversial provisions, including a net neutrality provision requiring that every data transmission be treated equally regardless of its content, origin, destination, service, terminal, or application, and a restriction on how companies that collect online data share that information with government officials. Although an earlier draft of the law would have required foreign companies (such as Facebook) to store data concerning Brazilian users on Brazil-based servers, those provisions garnered considerable opposition and were ultimately defeated. The law, however, does include a "longarm" jurisdiction provision that allows the Brazilian government to enforce its provisions against off-shore businesses that collect, maintain, or store data from Brazilian users.

Oi was charged with violating the provisions of the law that prohibit Internet service providers and mobile app providers from blocking, monitoring, filtering, or analyzing any data transmission. The DPDC found that Oi violated the law by, among other actions, overriding network defaults and misleading consumers by failing to disclose how browsing histories would be charted and used for advertising purposes. Oi's partner, Phorm, had already been the subject of an investigation by officials in the U.K. and European Union. Although it paid the fine, Oi has denied any violation of the law, reportedly asserting that the use of the tracking software was limited to a small group of consumers who had been invited to and agreed to

This publication may constitute "Attorney Advertising" under the New York Rules of Professional Conduct and under the law of other jurisdictions. participate in the testing of the tracking software. Oi also asserts that its use of the tracking software was overseen by Brazilian regulators and was suspended in March 2013, and that no data has been sold to third parties. The company reportedly intends to appeal the DPDC's decision, but it remains to be seen whether customers will bring individual civil suits or class actions for injuries associated with the alleged privacy violation.

The nearly \$1.6 million fine should serve as a warning to multinational companies operating in the fastgrowing Brazilian market to take appropriate measures to comply with all applicable laws—domestically and internationally. For more information about global data optimization and technology compliance strategies, contact <u>leuan Jolly</u> (212.407.4810) or <u>James Taylor</u> (212.407.4895).

This alert is a publication of Loeb & Loeb and is intended to provide information on recent legal developments. This alert does not create or continue an attorney client relationship nor should it be construed as legal advice or an opinion on specific situations.

© 2014 Loeb & Loeb LLP. All rights reserved.

Advanced Media and Technology Department

AMIR AZARANAAZARAN@LOEB.COM312.464.3330IVY KAGAN BIERMANIBIERMAN@LOEB.COM310.282.2327CHRISTIAN D. CARBONECCARBONE@LOEB.COM212.407.4852TAMARA CARMICHAELTCARMICHAEL@LOEB.COM212.407.4225MARC CHAMLINMCHAMLIN@LOEB.COM212.407.4855MARGARET CHARENDOFFMCHARENDOFF@LOEB.COM212.407.4069PATRICK N. DOWNESPDOWNES@LOEB.COM310.282.2352CRAIG A. EMANUELCEMANUEL@LOEB.COM310.282.2262KENNETH R. FLORINKFLORIN@LOEB.COM312.464.3122NOREEN P. GOSSELINNGOSSELIN@LOEB.COM312.464.3179DAVID W. GRACEDGRACE@LOEB.COM310.282.2108NATHAN J. HOLENHOLE@LOEB.COM310.282.2143THOMAS P. JIRGALTJIRGAL@LOEB.COM310.282.2143THOMAS P. JIRGALTJIRGAL@LOEB.COM312.464.3150IEUAN JOLLYIJOLLY@LOEB.COM312.464.3170JULIE E. LANDJLAND@LOEB.COM312.464.3161JESSICA B. LEEJBLEE@LOEB.COM312.464.3161JESSICA B. LEEJBLEE@LOEB.COM212.407.4838DAVID G. MALLENDMALLEN@LOEB.COM212.407.4838DAVID G. MALLENDMALLEN@LOEB.COM212.407.4286MICHAEL MALLOWMMALLOV@LOEB.COM310.282.2287	KENNETH A. ADLER	KADLER@LOEB.COM	212.407.4284
CHRISTIAN D. CARBONECCARBONE@LOEB.COM212.407.4852TAMARA CARMICHAELTCARMICHAEL@LOEB.COM212.407.4225MARC CHAMLINMCHAMLIN@LOEB.COM212.407.4255MARC CHAMLINMCHAMLIN@LOEB.COM212.407.4855MARGARET CHARENDOFFMCHARENDOFF@LOEB.COM212.407.4069PATRICK N. DOWNESPDOWNES@LOEB.COM310.282.2352CRAIG A. EMANUELCEMANUEL@LOEB.COM310.282.2262KENNETH R. FLORINKFLORIN@LOEB.COM212.407.4966DANIEL D. FROHLINGDFROHLING@LOEB.COM312.464.3122NOREEN P. GOSSELINNGOSSELIN@LOEB.COM312.464.3179DAVID W. GRACEDGRACE@LOEB.COM310.282.2108NATHAN J. HOLENHOLE@LOEB.COM310.282.2143THOMAS P. JIRGALTJIRGAL@LOEB.COM312.464.3150IEUAN JOLLYJJOLY@LOEB.COM312.464.3170JULIY@LOEB.COM312.464.3170JULIY@LOEB.COMJULIA M. KISERLKISER@LOEB.COM312.464.3170JULIE E. LANDJLAND@LOEB.COM312.464.3170JULIE E. LANDJLAND@LOEB.COM312.464.3161JESSICA B. LEEJBLEE@LOEB.COM212.407.4073SCOTT S. LIEBMANSLIEBMAN@LOEB.COM212.407.4286DAVID G. MALLENDMALLEN@LOEB.COM212.407.4286	AMIR AZARAN	AAZARAN@LOEB.COM	312.464.3330
TAMARA CARMICHAELTCARMICHAEL@LOEB.COM212.407.4225MARC CHAMLINMCHAMLIN@LOEB.COM212.407.4855MARGARET CHARENDOFFMCHARENDOFF@LOEB.COM212.407.4855MARGARET CHARENDOFFMCHARENDOFF@LOEB.COM212.407.4069PATRICK N. DOWNESPDOWNES@LOEB.COM310.282.2352CRAIG A. EMANUELCEMANUEL@LOEB.COM310.282.2262KENNETH R. FLORINKFLORIN@LOEB.COM212.407.4966DANIEL D. FROHLINGDFROHLING@LOEB.COM312.464.3122NOREEN P. GOSSELINNGOSSELIN@LOEB.COM312.464.3179DAVID W. GRACEDGRACE@LOEB.COM310.282.2108NATHAN J. HOLENHOLE@LOEB.COM312.464.3110MELANIE J. HOWARDMHOWARD@LOEB.COM312.464.3150IEUAN JOLLYIJOLLY@LOEB.COM312.464.3150IEUAN JOLLYIJOLLY@LOEB.COM312.464.3170JULIE E. LANDJLAND@LOEB.COM312.464.3161JESSICA B. LEEJBLEE@LOEB.COM312.464.3161JESSICA B. LEEJBLEE@LOEB.COM212.407.4838DAVID G. MALLENDMALLEN@LOEB.COM212.407.4286	IVY KAGAN BIERMAN	IBIERMAN@LOEB.COM	310.282.2327
MARC CHAMLINMCHAMLIN@LOEB.COM212.407.4855MARGARET CHARENDOFFMCHARENDOFF@LOEB.COM212.407.4069PATRICK N. DOWNESPDOWNES@LOEB.COM310.282.2352CRAIG A. EMANUELCEMANUEL@LOEB.COM310.282.2262KENNETH R. FLORINKFLORIN@LOEB.COM212.407.4966DANIEL D. FROHLINGDFROHLING@LOEB.COM312.464.3122NOREEN P. GOSSELINNGOSSELIN@LOEB.COM312.464.3179DAVID W. GRACEDGRACE@LOEB.COM310.282.2108NATHAN J. HOLENHOLE@LOEB.COM310.282.2143THOMAS P. JIRGALTJIRGAL@LOEB.COM312.464.3150IEUAN JOLLYIJOLLY@LOEB.COM212.407.4928LIVIA M. KISERLKISER@LOEB.COM312.464.3170JULIE E. LANDJLAND@LOEB.COM312.464.3161JESSICA B. LEEJBLEE@LOEB.COM212.407.4073SCOTT S. LIEBMANSLIEBMAN@LOEB.COM212.407.4286	CHRISTIAN D. CARBONE	CCARBONE@LOEB.COM	212.407.4852
MARGARET CHARENDOFFMCHARENDOFF@LOEB.COM212.407.4069PATRICK N. DOWNESPDOWNES@LOEB.COM310.282.2352CRAIG A. EMANUELCEMANUEL@LOEB.COM310.282.2262KENNETH R. FLORINKFLORIN@LOEB.COM212.407.4966DANIEL D. FROHLINGDFROHLING@LOEB.COM312.464.3122NOREEN P. GOSSELINNGOSSELIN@LOEB.COM312.464.3179DAVID W. GRACEDGRACE@LOEB.COM310.282.2108NATHAN J. HOLENHOLE@LOEB.COM310.282.2143THOMAS P. JIRGALTJIRGAL@LOEB.COM310.282.2143THOMAS P. JIRGALTJIRGAL@LOEB.COM312.464.3150IEUAN JOLLYJJOLLY@LOEB.COM212.407.4810ELIZABETH H. KIMEKIM@LOEB.COM312.464.3170JULIE E. LANDJLAND@LOEB.COM312.464.3161JESSICA B. LEEJBLEE@LOEB.COM212.407.4838DAVID G. MALLENDMALLEN@LOEB.COM212.407.4286	TAMARA CARMICHAEL	TCARMICHAEL@LOEB.COM	212.407.4225
PATRICK N. DOWNESPDOWNES@LOEB.COM310.282.2352CRAIG A. EMANUELCEMANUEL@LOEB.COM310.282.2262KENNETH R. FLORINKFLORIN@LOEB.COM212.407.4966DANIEL D. FROHLINGDFROHLING@LOEB.COM312.464.3122NOREEN P. GOSSELINNGOSSELIN@LOEB.COM312.464.3179DAVID W. GRACEDGRACE@LOEB.COM310.282.2108NATHAN J. HOLENHOLE@LOEB.COM310.282.2108NATHAN J. HOLENHOLE@LOEB.COM310.282.2143THOMAS P. JIRGALTJIRGAL@LOEB.COM310.282.2143ELIZABETH H. KIMEKIM@LOEB.COM212.407.4810ELIZABETH H. KIMEKIM@LOEB.COM312.464.3170JULIE E. LANDJLAND@LOEB.COM312.464.3161JESSICA B. LEEJBLEE@LOEB.COM212.407.4838DAVID G. MALLENDMALLEN@LOEB.COM212.407.4286	MARC CHAMLIN	MCHAMLIN@LOEB.COM	212.407.4855
CRAIG A. EMANUELCEMANUEL@LOEB.COM310.282.2262KENNETH R. FLORINKFLORIN@LOEB.COM212.407.4966DANIEL D. FROHLINGDFROHLING@LOEB.COM312.464.3122NOREEN P. GOSSELINNGOSSELIN@LOEB.COM312.464.3179DAVID W. GRACEDGRACE@LOEB.COM310.282.2108NATHAN J. HOLENHOLE@LOEB.COM310.282.2143THOMAS P. JIRGALTJIRGAL@LOEB.COM310.282.2143THOMAS P. JIRGALTJIRGAL@LOEB.COM312.464.3150IEUAN JOLLYJJOLLY@LOEB.COM212.407.4810ELIZABETH H. KIMEKIM@LOEB.COM312.464.3170JULIE E. LANDJLAND@LOEB.COM312.464.3161JESSICA B. LEEJBLEE@LOEB.COM212.407.4838DAVID G. MALLENDMALLEN@LOEB.COM212.407.4286	MARGARET CHARENDOFF	MCHARENDOFF@LOEB.COM	212.407.4069
KENNETH R. FLORINKFLORIN@LOEB.COM212.407.4966DANIEL D. FROHLINGDFROHLING@LOEB.COM312.464.3122NOREEN P. GOSSELINNGOSSELIN@LOEB.COM312.464.3179DAVID W. GRACEDGRACE@LOEB.COM310.282.2108NATHAN J. HOLENHOLE@LOEB.COM312.464.3110MELANIE J. HOWARDMHOWARD@LOEB.COM310.282.2143THOMAS P. JIRGALTJIRGAL@LOEB.COM312.464.3150IEUAN JOLLYIJOLLY@LOEB.COM212.407.4810ELIZABETH H. KIMEKIM@LOEB.COM312.464.3170JULIE E. LANDJLAND@LOEB.COM312.464.3161JESSICA B. LEEJBLEE@LOEB.COM212.407.4838DAVID G. MALLENDMALLEN@LOEB.COM212.407.4286	PATRICK N. DOWNES	PDOWNES@LOEB.COM	310.282.2352
DANIEL D. FROHLINGDFROHLING@LOEB.COM312.464.3122NOREEN P. GOSSELINNGOSSELIN@LOEB.COM312.464.3179DAVID W. GRACEDGRACE@LOEB.COM310.282.2108NATHAN J. HOLENHOLE@LOEB.COM312.464.3110MELANIE J. HOWARDMHOWARD@LOEB.COM310.282.2143THOMAS P. JIRGALTJIRGAL@LOEB.COM312.464.3150IEUAN JOLLYIJOLLY@LOEB.COM212.407.4810ELIZABETH H. KIMEKIM@LOEB.COM312.464.3170JULIE E. LANDJLAND@LOEB.COM312.464.3161JESSICA B. LEEJBLEE@LOEB.COM212.407.4073SCOTT S. LIEBMANSLIEBMAN@LOEB.COM212.407.4286DAVID G. MALLENDMALLEN@LOEB.COM212.407.4286	CRAIG A. EMANUEL	CEMANUEL@LOEB.COM	310.282.2262
NOREEN P. GOSSELINNGOSSELIN@LOEB.COM312.464.3179DAVID W. GRACEDGRACE@LOEB.COM310.282.2108NATHAN J. HOLENHOLE@LOEB.COM312.464.3110MELANIE J. HOWARDMHOWARD@LOEB.COM310.282.2143THOMAS P. JIRGALTJIRGAL@LOEB.COM312.464.3150IEUAN JOLLYJJOLLY@LOEB.COM212.407.4810ELIZABETH H. KIMEKIM@LOEB.COM212.407.4928LIVIA M. KISERLKISER@LOEB.COM312.464.3170JULIE E. LANDJLAND@LOEB.COM312.464.3161JESSICA B. LEEJBLEE@LOEB.COM212.407.4073SCOTT S. LIEBMANSLIEBMAN@LOEB.COM212.407.4286	KENNETH R. FLORIN	KFLORIN@LOEB.COM	212.407.4966
DAVID W. GRACEDGRACE@LOEB.COM310.282.2108NATHAN J. HOLENHOLE@LOEB.COM312.464.3110MELANIE J. HOWARDMHOWARD@LOEB.COM310.282.2143THOMAS P. JIRGALTJIRGAL@LOEB.COM312.464.3150IEUAN JOLLYIJOLLY@LOEB.COM212.407.4810ELIZABETH H. KIMEKIM@LOEB.COM212.407.4928LIVIA M. KISERLKISER@LOEB.COM312.464.3170JULIE E. LANDJLAND@LOEB.COM312.464.3161JESSICA B. LEEJBLEE@LOEB.COM212.407.4073SCOTT S. LIEBMANSLIEBMAN@LOEB.COM212.407.4286DAVID G. MALLENDMALLEN@LOEB.COM212.407.4286	DANIEL D. FROHLING	DFROHLING@LOEB.COM	312.464.3122
NATHAN J. HOLENHOLE@LOEB.COM312.464.3110MELANIE J. HOWARDMHOWARD@LOEB.COM310.282.2143THOMAS P. JIRGALTJIRGAL@LOEB.COM312.464.3150IEUAN JOLLYIJOLLY@LOEB.COM212.407.4810ELIZABETH H. KIMEKIM@LOEB.COM212.407.4928LIVIA M. KISERLKISER@LOEB.COM312.464.3170JULIE E. LANDJLAND@LOEB.COM312.464.3161JESSICA B. LEEJBLEE@LOEB.COM212.407.4073SCOTT S. LIEBMANSLIEBMAN@LOEB.COM212.407.4286DAVID G. MALLENDMALLEN@LOEB.COM212.407.4286	NOREEN P. GOSSELIN	NGOSSELIN@LOEB.COM	312.464.3179
MELANIE J. HOWARDMHOWARD@LOEB.COM310.282.2143THOMAS P. JIRGALTJIRGAL@LOEB.COM312.464.3150IEUAN JOLLYJJOLLY@LOEB.COM212.407.4810ELIZABETH H. KIMEKIM@LOEB.COM212.407.4928LIVIA M. KISERLKISER@LOEB.COM312.464.3170JULIE E. LANDJLAND@LOEB.COM312.464.3161JESSICA B. LEEJBLEE@LOEB.COM212.407.4073SCOTT S. LIEBMANSLIEBMAN@LOEB.COM212.407.4286DAVID G. MALLENDMALLEN@LOEB.COM212.407.4286	DAVID W. GRACE	DGRACE@LOEB.COM	310.282.2108
THOMAS P. JIRGAL TJIRGAL@LOEB.COM 312.464.3150 IEUAN JOLLY IJOLLY@LOEB.COM 212.407.4810 ELIZABETH H. KIM EKIM@LOEB.COM 212.407.4928 LIVIA M. KISER LKISER@LOEB.COM 312.464.3170 JULIE E. LAND JLAND@LOEB.COM 312.464.3161 JESSICA B. LEE JBLEE@LOEB.COM 212.407.4073 SCOTT S. LIEBMAN SLIEBMAN@LOEB.COM 212.407.4838 DAVID G. MALLEN DMALLEN@LOEB.COM 212.407.4286	NATHAN J. HOLE	NHOLE@LOEB.COM	312.464.3110
IEUAN JOLLY IJOLLY@LOEB.COM 212.407.4810 ELIZABETH H. KIM EKIM@LOEB.COM 212.407.4928 LIVIA M. KISER LKISER@LOEB.COM 312.464.3170 JULIE E. LAND JLAND@LOEB.COM 312.464.3161 JESSICA B. LEE JBLEE@LOEB.COM 212.407.4073 SCOTT S. LIEBMAN SLIEBMAN@LOEB.COM 212.407.4838 DAVID G. MALLEN DMALLEN@LOEB.COM 212.407.4286	MELANIE J. HOWARD	MHOWARD@LOEB.COM	310.282.2143
ELIZABETH H. KIM EKIM@LOEB.COM 212.407.4928 LIVIA M. KISER LKISER@LOEB.COM 312.464.3170 JULIE E. LAND JLAND@LOEB.COM 312.464.3161 JESSICA B. LEE JBLEE@LOEB.COM 212.407.4073 SCOTT S. LIEBMAN SLIEBMAN@LOEB.COM 212.407.4838 DAVID G. MALLEN DMALLEN@LOEB.COM 212.407.4286	THOMAS P. JIRGAL	TJIRGAL@LOEB.COM	312.464.3150
LIVIA M. KISERLKISER@LOEB.COM312.464.3170JULIE E. LANDJLAND@LOEB.COM312.464.3161JESSICA B. LEEJBLEE@LOEB.COM212.407.4073SCOTT S. LIEBMANSLIEBMAN@LOEB.COM212.407.4838DAVID G. MALLENDMALLEN@LOEB.COM212.407.4286	IEUAN JOLLY	IJOLLY@LOEB.COM	212.407.4810
JULIE E. LAND JLAND@LOEB.COM 312.464.3161 JESSICA B. LEE JBLEE@LOEB.COM 212.407.4073 SCOTT S. LIEBMAN SLIEBMAN@LOEB.COM 212.407.4838 DAVID G. MALLEN DMALLEN@LOEB.COM 212.407.4286	ELIZABETH H. KIM	EKIM@LOEB.COM	212.407.4928
JESSICA B. LEE JBLEE@LOEB.COM 212.407.4073 SCOTT S. LIEBMAN SLIEBMAN@LOEB.COM 212.407.4838 DAVID G. MALLEN DMALLEN@LOEB.COM 212.407.4286	LIVIA M. KISER	LKISER@LOEB.COM	312.464.3170
SCOTT S. LIEBMANSLIEBMAN@LOEB.COM212.407.4838DAVID G. MALLENDMALLEN@LOEB.COM212.407.4286	JULIE E. LAND	JLAND@LOEB.COM	312.464.3161
DAVID G. MALLEN DMALLEN@LOEB.COM 212.407.4286	JESSICA B. LEE	JBLEE@LOEB.COM	212.407.4073
	SCOTT S. LIEBMAN	SLIEBMAN@LOEB.COM	212.407.4838
MICHAEL MALLOW MMALLOW@LOEB.COM 310.282.2287	DAVID G. MALLEN	DMALLEN@LOEB.COM	212.407.4286
	MICHAEL MALLOW	MMALLOW@LOEB.COM	310.282.2287

KMASON@LOEB.COM	212.407.4898
DMASTERS@LOEB.COM	312.464.3144
NMCGINN@LOEB.COM	312.464.3130
AMCGUIRE@LOEB.COM	212.407.4143
DMURPHY@LOEB.COM	310.282.2215
BNIXON@LOEB.COM	202.618.5013
SPAIK@LOEB.COM	312.464.3119
APROVENCIO@LOEB.COM	312.464.3123
CREILLY@LOEB.COM	310.282.2361
KROGERS-LOPEZ@LOEB.COM	310.282.2306
SROSE@LOEB.COM	312.464.3177
Z RSANCHEZ@LOEB.COM	212.407.4173
TSAUNDERS@LOEB.COM	312.464.3174
ASCHWARTZ@LOEB.COM	312.464.3169
BSLOTNICK@LOEB.COM	212.407.4162
RASMITH@LOEB.COM	312.464.3137
BSOCOLOW@LOEB.COM	212.407.4872
WSTEIMEL@LOEB.COM	202.618.5015
ASTERN@LOEB.COM	212.407.4235
JTAYLOR@LOEB.COM	212.407.4895
JWESTMORELAND@LOEB.COM	212.407.4019
DWHITE@LOEB.COM	212.407.4216
MZWEIG@LOEB.COM	212.407.4960
	DMASTERS@LOEB.COM NMCGINN@LOEB.COM AMCGUIRE@LOEB.COM DMURPHY@LOEB.COM BNIXON@LOEB.COM SPAIK@LOEB.COM APROVENCIO@LOEB.COM CREILLY@LOEB.COM CREILLY@LOEB.COM SROSE@LOEB.COM SROSE@LOEB.COM TSAUNDERS@LOEB.COM ASCHWARTZ@LOEB.COM BSLOTNICK@LOEB.COM BSLOTNICK@LOEB.COM BSOCOLOW@LOEB.COM USTEIMEL@LOEB.COM JTAYLOR@LOEB.COM